

## **DOCTORAL THESIS**

### **Art history in an infant primary school an intervention in the curriculum**

Pitfield Worsley, Laura

*Award date:*  
2011

*Awarding institution:*  
University of Roehampton

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

#### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

ART HISTORY IN AN INFANT PRIMARY SCHOOL:  
AN INTERVENTION IN THE CURRICULUM

Laura Pitfield Worsley

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of  
the requirements for the degree of  
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Faculty of Education  
ROEHAMPTON UNIVERSITY  
London  
June, 2011

## **ABSTRACT**

This research set out to introduce art history in the art curriculum in an infant primary school in England. The intention was to broaden the curriculum to include interpreting art alongside making it. At the time the research began the National Art and Design Curriculum (2005) for Key Stage One included an art historical strand of learning known as Attainment Target Two (AT2) which included learning about art and artists from different times and cultures. Previous research indicated this strand of the art curriculum was overlooked by generalist classroom teachers for various reasons.

A whole school action research project was undertaken lasting a full academic year. The participants were five teachers including the headteacher, three classroom teaching assistants, eighty four pupils, aged between four and seven years, and the researcher. The research tested out and evaluated a strategy for interpreting artworks. This was designed by the researcher and taught by the teachers in the classroom. The interpretive strategy for engaging and enquiring about art (known as the ISEE) included information about the art and artist in the final step of interpretation. The action research consisted of three cycles: i) preparation, planning and teacher training; ii) teachers implementing the ISEE and iii) teacher-designed lessons and research evaluation. Systematic reflection and evaluation of actions was carried out on two levels by the action team and the lead researcher and final reflective and thematic analyses were carried out by the latter in order to answer the research questions.

The main finding was that the ISEE facilitated art interpretation in the classroom. Other significant findings were that i) interpreting paintings was inclusive of all pupils across the age groups and learning ability spectra; ii) the pupils' affective response (Iser, 2006) often drove their cognition and this challenged the theory underpinning the research that art is interpreted through symbol references in meaning making; iii) when pupils used their imagination and affective response they were able to accommodate the factual information they were given about the paintings and artists; iv) despite struggling to include this information in their teaching at times, the teachers recognised that it added value to the art curriculum and the pupils expressed great interest in it and iv) the teachers preferred to combine art interpretation with other subjects such as literacy, citizenship and PSHE.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply grateful to many people and Roehampton University for providing the opportunity, support and resources for me to conduct this research, reflect on it and reach conclusions that I hope will contribute to the work of others. In particular, I would like to express my thanks to my Director of Studies, Professor Rachel Mason, for opening my eyes to the world of art education and for her wisdom and guidance. I am also very grateful to my supervisor, Dr. Nicholas Houghton, for his big picture views, thoughtful insights, encouragement and useful and amusing analogies. As well, my thanks to Dr Dorothy Rowe for her help as 2<sup>nd</sup> supervisor, in the initial stages of this research.

Roehampton University provided a stimulating environment and I met and studied with a wide body of interesting and thought provoking academics. My fellow colleagues in the Centre for International Research on Creativity and Learning in Education (CIRCLE) with whom I shared and argued ideas back and forth provided a lifeline on many occasions and I wish them all the best of luck. In particular, I would like to thank Dr. Maho Sato for her friendship.

For an entire year, I experienced life in a infant primary school alongside the headteacher, teachers, pupils and parents and I am enormously grateful for this opportunity and the friendships that it spawned; it was invaluable. My dear thanks to my mother, Di Pitfield McAvoy, who introduced me to Judkins and art history and Leslie Stratford, an artist and fellow art historian for the many times their insights and humour encouraged me on this journey.

Most of all, my great thanks to my dear husband and friend, Jonathan who made it possible for me to carry out this research and to each of our four children, Nicholas, Oliver, Hugo and Charlotte. They have supported, challenged and indulged me at every turn and I know they have waited patiently for this day to come. Above all, I hope they take from this example the value of pursuing challenges they believe are important.

For my father

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                    |  |
|--------------------|--|
| Title page         |  |
| Abstract           |  |
| Acknowledgements   |  |
| Table of contents  |  |
| Bibliography       |  |
| List of Appendices |  |
| List of Figures    |  |
| List of Tables     |  |

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b>  | xiv   |
| <b>I. BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH</b>                           | xiv   |
| <b>II. WORKING DEFINITIONS OF KEY CONCEPTS</b>                 | xvi   |
| II. i Art history  | xvi   |
| II. ii Art education   | xvi   |
| II. iii Visual literacy  | xvii  |
| <b>III. BROAD PROBLEM AREA</b>                                 | xvii  |
| III.i Locating the research                                    | xix   |
| III. ii Art history in the twenty-first century                | xix   |
| III. iii Why learn about art and artists in primary education? | xx    |
| III. iv Mainstream primary and secondary art education         | xxi   |
| III. v. Critical studies in secondary education                | xxii  |
| <b>IV. SPECIFIC PROBLEM AREA</b>                               | xxiii |
| <b>V. SUMMARY PROBLEM STATEMENT</b>                            | xxiv  |
| V. i Purpose of study  | xxv   |
| V.ii Research questions  | xxv   |
| <b>VI. ORGANISATION OF THESIS</b>                              | xxvi  |

## **CHAPTER ONE: CONCEPTIONS OF ART HISTORY, TEACHING AND INTERPRETATION**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1.0 Introduction  | 1  |
| <b>1.1 CHANGING PARADIGMS OF ART HISTORY</b>                                  | 1  |
| 1.1.1 Twenty-first century  | 8  |
| 1.1.2 Implications for research   | 9  |
| 1.1.3 Relationship to art appreciation and criticism                          | 10 |
| 1.1.4 Implications for research   | 11 |
| <b>1.2 RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN ART EDUCATION IN THE USA AND UNITED KINGDOM</b> | 11 |
| <b>1.3 INTERPRETING AND MAKING MEANING IN ART</b>                             | 13 |
| 1.3.1 Theories of meaning construction and interpretation                     | 16 |
| 1.3.2 Iconographical/Iconological meaning in art (Panofsky, 1955)             | 16 |
| 1.3.2.1 Step One: Primary or natural subject matter                           | 18 |
| 1.3.2.2 Step Two: Secondary or conventional subject matter                    | 19 |
| 1.3.2.3 Step Three: Iconological, intrinsic meaning or content                | 20 |
| 1.3.2.4 Criticism   | 20 |
| 1.3.3 Theories of art as communication  | 21 |
| 1.3.3.1 Theory of symbolism   | 21 |
| 1.3.3.2 Theories of expression and emotion                                    | 22 |
| 1.3.4 Expression and reception  | 24 |
| 1.3.4.1 Reader response theory  | 24 |

|  |        |
|--|--------|
| 1.3.4.2 Theory of affect   | 25     |
| <b>1.4 CONSTRUCTIVIST AND SOCIAL CONSTRUCTIVIST THEORIES OF LEARNING</b> | 26     |
| 1.4.1 Constructivist theory  | 26     |
| 1.4.2 Social constructivist theory                                       | 29     |
| <b>1.5 KEY FINDINGS</b>  | 31     |
| <br><b>CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>                             | <br>33 |
| 2.0 Introduction   | 33     |
| 2.0.1 The school context   | 33     |
| <b>2.1 CHOICE OF METHODOLOGY</b>   | 34     |
| 2.1.1 What is action research?   | 35     |
| 2.1.2 Rationale  | 35     |
| 2.1.3 Collaborative action research                                      | 36     |
| 2.1.4 Limitations of action research                                     | 37     |
| 2.1.5 Selecting Elliott's model (1991)                                   | 39     |
| 2.1.6. Developing a hybrid version of action research                    | 40     |
| <br><b>2.2 DESIGNING AND PLANNING OF RESEARCH</b>                        | <br>42 |
| 2.2.1 Negotiating the research   | 42     |
| 2.2.2 Research model   | 43     |
| 2.2.3 Aims   | 44     |
| 2.2.4 Timescale  | 44     |
| 2.2.5 Participants   | 45     |
| 2.2.5.1 Action team  | 45     |
| 2.2.5.2 Observation team   | 46     |
| 2.2.5.3 Others   | 46     |
| 2.2.5.4 Pupils   | 46     |
| 2.2.6 Researcher role and responsibilities                               | 46     |
| 2.2.6.1 Trainer  | 47     |
| 2.2.6.2 Co-ordinator/organiser   | 47     |
| 2.2.6.3 Observer   | 47     |
| 2.2.6.4 Researcher   | 48     |
| 2.2.7 Potential concerns   | 48     |
| 2.2.8 Ethical considerations   | 48     |
| <br><b>2.3 CYCLES</b>  | <br>49 |
| 2.3.0 Introduction   | 49     |
| 2.3.1 Cycle One (Preparation and planning)                               | 50     |
| 2.3.1.1 Aims and roles   | 50     |
| 2.3.1.2 Action team  | 50     |
| 2.3.1.3 Researcher   | 50     |
| 2.3.1.4 Actions  | 51     |
| 2.3.1.5 Activities   | 51     |
| <br>2.3.2 Cycle Two: Implementing the ISEE                               | <br>52 |
| 2.3.2.1 Aims and roles   | 52     |
| 2.3.2.2 Action team  | 52     |
| 2.3.2.3 Observation team   | 52     |
| 2.3.2.4 Researcher   | 52     |
| 2.3.2.5 Actions  | 52     |
| 2.3.2.6 Activities   | 53     |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 2.3.3 Cycle Three: Teachers' lessons and research evaluation                | 53 |
| 2.3.3.1 Aims and roles  | 53 |
| 2.3.3.2 Action team   | 53 |
| 2.3.3.3 Observation team  | 53 |
| 2.3.3.4 Researcher  | 53 |
| 2.3.3.5 Actions   | 54 |
| 2.3.3.6 Activities  | 54 |
| <b>2.4 DESIGN OF DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS</b>                            | 54 |
| 2.4.1 Instruments   | 55 |
| 2.4.2 Diagnostic  | 56 |
| 2.4.2.1 Staff questionnaire   | 56 |
| 2.4.2.2 Piloting staff questionnaire  | 57 |
| 2.4.2.3 Pupil interview schedule  | 57 |
| 2.4.2.4 Piloting interview schedule   | 58 |
| 2.4.2.5 Pupils' group interview schedule                                    | 59 |
| 2.4.3 Ongoing   | 59 |
| 2.4.3.1 Teacher record form   | 59 |
| 2.4.3.2 Observer record form  | 60 |
| 2.4.4 Additional instruments for data gathering                             | 61 |
| 2.4.4.1 Tape recordings and transcripts                                     | 61 |
| 2.4.4.2 Researcher's fieldnotes   | 62 |
| 2.4.4.3 Reflective journal  | 63 |
| 2.4.4.4 Pupils' work  | 65 |
| 2.4.4.5 Photographs   | 65 |
| 2.4.5 Summary of data collection instruments                                | 65 |
| <b>2.5 DATA ANALYSIS</b>  | 67 |
| 2.5.1 Reflection and reflexivity  | 67 |
| 2.5.2 Thematic analysis   | 68 |
| 2.5.3 Process of data analysis  | 70 |
| <b>CHAPTER THREE: DEVELOPING THE ISEE STRATEGY</b>                          | 75 |
| 3.0 Introduction  | 75 |
| <b>3.1 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK</b>   | 75 |
| 3.1.2 Forms of knowledge  | 76 |
| <b>3.2 THE NATIONAL CURRICULUM AND OTHER FRAMEWORKS</b>                     | 76 |
| 3.2.1 Historical/cultural   | 77 |
| 3.2.2 Critical/analytical   | 78 |
| 3.2.3 Sensory   | 79 |
| 3.2.4 Art making  | 79 |
| 3.2.5 Questioning frameworks  | 80 |
| <b>3.3 SUMMARY</b>  | 81 |
| <b>3.4 DETAILS OF ISEE STRATEGY, ART INFORMATION AND PAINTINGS</b>          | 84 |
| 3.4.1 The Interpretive Strategy for Engaging and Enquiring about art (ISEE) | 84 |
| 3.4.2 Rationale   | 87 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 3.4.3 Step One: What do you see?                                   | 87  |
| 3.4.4 Step Two: What is in the painting? How do you feel about it? | 88  |
| 3.4.4.1 Part A: question and analyse                               | 88  |
| 3.4.4.2 Part B: relate to  | 88  |
| 3.4.5 Step Three: Interpreting with art information                | 89  |
| 3.4.5.1 Selecting criteria for art information criteria            | 89  |
| <b>3.5 RESEARCH LESSONS</b>  | 92  |
| 3.5.1 Design   | 93  |
| <b>3.6 SELECTION OF ARTWORKS</b>                                   | 96  |
| 3.6.1 Using fine art ‘masterpiece’ paintings                       | 96  |
| 3.6.2 Informing the selection process                              | 97  |
| 3.6.3 Issues in selection  | 99  |
| 3.6.4 Criteria for selection                                       | 100 |
| 3.6.5 Inclusion and exclusion criteria                             | 100 |
| <b>3.7 SELECTION OF PAINTINGS</b>                                  | 101 |
| 3.7.1 Rationale  | 101 |
| 3.7.2 <i>Tropical Storm, Surprised!</i>                            | 104 |
| 3.7.3 <i>Courtyard of a House in Delft</i>                         | 105 |
| 3.7.4 <i>Le Domaine d’Arnheim</i>                                  | 106 |
| 3.7.5 <i>The Graham Children</i>                                   | 106 |
| 3.7.6 <i>The Fall of Icarus</i>                                    | 107 |
| 3.7.7 <i>The Portrait of Mr and Mrs Andrews</i>                    | 108 |
| 3.7.8 <i>Untitled: Grey and Brown</i>                              | 108 |
| <b>3.8 SUMMARY</b>   | 109 |
| <b>CHAPTER FOUR: PREPARATION</b>                                   | 110 |
| 4.0 Introduction   | 110 |
| <b>4.1 CYCLE ONE</b>   | 110 |
| 4.1.1 Aims   | 110 |
| 4.1.2 Participants   | 110 |
| 4.1.3 Details of actions   | 110 |
| 4.1.4 Timetable of actions   | 112 |
| <b>4.2 RESEARCHER PREPARATION</b>                                  | 112 |
| 4.2.1 Introduction   | 112 |
| <b>4.3 DIAGNOSTIC</b>  | 113 |
| 4.3.1 Staff questionnaire  | 113 |
| 4.3.2 Findings   | 113 |
| 4.3.2.1 Past experience of art                                     | 113 |
| 4.3.2.2 Strategies for engaging pupils with art                    | 114 |
| 4.3.2.3 Motivation to participate                                  | 114 |
| 4.3.2.4 Confidence talking about art                               | 114 |
| 4.3.2.5 Identified resources required for teaching                 | 115 |
| 4.3.3 Pupil interviews   | 115 |
| 4.3.4 Findings   | 117 |
| 4.3.4.1 Experience, motivation and preference in art               | 117 |
| 4.3.4.2 Disposition to talk about paintings                        | 119 |



|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>4.4 PARTICIPANTS' PREPARATION</b>                | 120 |
| 4.4.1 CPD training and ISEE practice sessions       | 120 |
| 4.4.1.1 Description                                 | 120 |
| 4.4.2 Demonstration lesson                          | 122 |
| 4.4.2.1 Description                                 | 123 |
| 4.4.3 ISEE practice sessions (#1 and #2)            | 125 |
| 4.4.3.1 Description                                 | 125 |
| <b>4.5 TEAM REFLECTION AND EVALUATION</b>           | 127 |
| <b>4.6 RESEARCHER REFLECTIONS</b>                   | 130 |
| 4.6.1 Action research                               | 131 |
| 4.6.2 Researcher roles                              | 134 |
| 4.6.3 Methodology for changing practice             | 134 |
| 4.6.4 Teaching and Learning                         | 135 |
| 4.6.4.1 Teachers                                    | 135 |
| 4.6.4.2 Pupils                                      | 135 |
| 4.6.4.3 Art history subject knowledge               | 136 |
| 4.6.5 Selection of paintings                        | 137 |
| <b>4.7 TEAM RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CYCLE TWO</b>       | 139 |
| <b>CHAPTER FIVE: IMPLEMENTING THE ISEE STRATEGY</b> | 140 |
| 5.0 Introduction                                    | 140 |
| <b>5.1 CYCLE TWO</b>                                | 140 |
| 5.1.1 Aims  | 140 |
| 5.1.2 Timetable                                     | 140 |
| 5.1.3 Participants                                  | 141 |
| 5.1.3.1 Action team                                 | 141 |
| 5.1.3.2 Observation team                            | 142 |
| 5.1.3.3 Pupils                                      | 142 |
| 5.1.3.4 Others                                      | 142 |
| 5.1.4 Details of actions                            | 142 |
| <b>5.2 RESEARCH LESSONS</b>                         | 144 |
| 5.2.1 Lesson One                                    | 144 |
| 5.2.1.1 Description                                 | 144 |
| 5.2.1.2 Team reflection and evaluation              | 147 |
| 5.2.2 Lesson Two                                    | 148 |
| 5.2.2.1 Description                                 | 149 |
| 5.2.2.2 Team reflection and evaluation              | 150 |
| 5.2.3 Lesson Three                                  | 152 |
| 5.2.3.1 Description                                 | 152 |
| 5.2.3.2 Team reflection and evaluation              | 154 |
| 5.2.4 Lesson Four                                   | 156 |
| 5.2.4.1 Description                                 | 156 |
| 5.2.4.2 Team reflection and evaluation              | 157 |
| 5.2.5 Lesson Five                                   | 159 |
| 5.2.5.1 Description                                 | 159 |
| 5.2.5.2 Team reflection and evaluation              | 161 |
| 5.2.6 Lesson Six                                    | 163 |
| 5.2.6.1 Description                                 | 163 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 5.2.6 2 Team reflection and evaluation                | 165 |
| 5.2.7 Lesson Seven                                    | 167 |
| 5.2.7.1 Description                                   | 167 |
| 5.2.7.2 Team reflection and evaluation                | 169 |
| 5.2.8 Lesson Eight                                    | 170 |
| 5.2.8.1 Description                                   | 170 |
| 5.2.8.2 Team reflection and evaluation                | 173 |
| 5.2.9 Lesson Nine                                     | 174 |
| 5.2.9.1 Description                                   | 174 |
| 5.2.9.2 Team reflection and evaluation                | 176 |
| <b>5.3 EVALUATION OF CYCLE</b>                        | 177 |
| 5.3.1 Summary of observers' evaluative comments       | 177 |
| 5.3.2 Final team reflection and evaluation            | 179 |
| <b>5.4 RESEARCHER REFLECTION</b>                      | 181 |
| 5.4.1 Action research                                 | 181 |
| 5.4.1.1 Shifting balances and leadership              | 181 |
| 5.4.1.2 Insider/Outsider researcher                   | 182 |
| 5.4.1.3 Methodology for changing practice             | 183 |
| 5.4.2 Implementing the ISEE                           | 184 |
| 5.4.2.1 Teaching styles, modes and delivery           | 184 |
| 5.4.2.2 Problems encountered with ISEE                | 184 |
| 5.4.2.3 Pupils' application of ISEE                   | 185 |
| 5.4.3 Modes of engagement                             | 186 |
| 5.4.4 Selection of paintings                          | 188 |
| 5.4.4.1 New technologies                              | 189 |
| <b>CHAPTER SIX: TEACHERS' LESSONS AND EVALUATIONS</b> | 191 |
| 6.0 Introduction                                      | 191 |
| <b>6.1 CYCLE THREE</b>                                | 191 |
| 6.1.1 Aims  | 191 |
| 6.1.2 Timetable of actions                            | 191 |
| 6.1.3 Participants                                    | 192 |
| 6.1.3.1 Action team                                   | 192 |
| 6.1.3.2 Pupils  | 192 |
| 6.1.3.3 Researcher                                    | 192 |
| 6.1.3.4 External consultant                           | 193 |
| 6.1.4 Details of actions                              | 193 |
| <b>6.2 LESSON ONE</b>                                 | 194 |
| 6.2.1 Planning  | 194 |
| 6.2.2 Selected artwork                                | 195 |
| 6.2.3 Reception Class                                 | 195 |
| 6.2.3.1 Preparation                                   | 195 |
| 6.2.3.2 Description                                   | 196 |
| 6.2.4 Year One  | 198 |
| 6.2.4.1 Preparation                                   | 198 |
| 6.2.4.2 Description                                   | 198 |
| 6.2.5 Year Two  | 200 |
| 6.2.5.1 Preparation                                   | 200 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 6.2.5.2 Description  | 201 |
| 6.2.6 Meeting with LA Consultant                             | 205 |
| 6.2.7 Team reflection and evaluation                         | 205 |
| 6.2.8 Researcher reflection on Lesson One                    | 206 |
| <b>6.3 LESSON TWO</b>  | 207 |
| 6.3.1 Reception Class  | 207 |
| 6.3.1.1 Teacher A's selected artwork                         | 207 |
| 6.3.1.2 Preparation  | 208 |
| 6.3.1.3 Description  | 208 |
| 6.3.2 Year One   | 210 |
| 6.3.2.1 Teacher C's selected artwork                         | 210 |
| 6.3.2.2 Preparation  | 210 |
| 6.3.2.3 Description  | 211 |
| 6.3.3 Year Two   | 212 |
| 6.3.3.1 Teacher D's selected artwork                         | 212 |
| 6.3.3.2 Preparation  | 213 |
| 6.3.3.3 Description  | 213 |
| 6.3.4 Team reflection and evaluation                         | 216 |
| <b>6.4 EVALUATION OF RESEARCH</b>                            | 218 |
| 6.4.0 Introduction   | 218 |
| 6.4.1 Group pupil interviews                                 | 218 |
| 6.4.1.1 Group interview schedule                             | 218 |
| 6.4.1.2 Detail of group interviews                           | 219 |
| 6.4.1.3 Summary of interviews                                | 219 |
| 6.4.1.4 Analysis of group interview findings                 | 221 |
| <b>6.5 SUMMATIVE EVALUATION MEETING</b>                      | 222 |
| 6.5.1 Details  | 222 |
| 6.5.2 Action research  | 223 |
| 6.5.3 Evaluation of ISEE                                     | 224 |
| 6.5.3.1 Weaknesses   | 225 |
| 6.5.3.2 Implications of interpreting art in the classroom    | 226 |
| 6.5.3.3 Limitations of interpreting art                      | 227 |
| 6.5.4 Methodology for changing practice                      | 227 |
| 6.5.5 Evaluation of selected paintings                       | 228 |
| <b>6.6 FINAL OVERALL RESEARCHER REFLECTIONS</b>              | 229 |
| 6.6.1 Action research as a methodology for changing practice | 229 |
| 6.6.2 Teaching and the ISEE strategy                         | 230 |
| 6.6.3 Learning and the ISEE strategy                         | 232 |
| <b>6.7 SORTING AND CODING DATA FOR ANALYSIS</b>              | 234 |
| <b>CHAPTER SEVEN: THEMATIC ANALYSIS</b>                      | 239 |
| 7.0 Introduction   | 239 |
| 7.0.1 Aims   | 239 |
| 7.0.2 Method   | 239 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>7.1 THEME ONE: TEACHER VARIABLE</b>                                   | 240 |
| 7.1.0 Introduction   | 240 |
| 7.1.1 Impact of teacher variable and its ripple effect                   | 240 |
| 7.1.2 Researcher presence  | 241 |
| 7.1.3 Teaching in observed settings                                      | 241 |
| 7.1.4 Attitudes, interest and beliefs about art                          | 242 |
| 7.1.4.1 Confidence   | 244 |
| 7.1.4.2 Control  | 245 |
| 7.1.5 Ownership  | 246 |
| 7.1.6 Risk-taking and flexibility  | 247 |
| 7.1.7 Teachers' diverse roles  | 248 |
| 7.1.7.1 Scaffolding and guiding  | 248 |
| 7.1.7.2 Participant in whole class discussion                            | 249 |
| 7.1.7.3 Provider of art information                                      | 250 |
| 7.1.8 Conclusion   | 251 |
| <b>7.2 THEME TWO: AFFECTIVE RESPONSE</b>                                 | 251 |
| 7.2.0 Introduction   | 251 |
| 7.2.1 Changing theoretical assumptions                                   | 251 |
| 7.2.2 Expression theories  | 252 |
| 7.2.3 Reader reception and response                                      | 253 |
| 7.2.4 Demonstrating affective response                                   | 254 |
| 7.2.4.1 Empathy and affect   | 255 |
| 7.2.4.2 Placing oneself in a painting and conjectured feelings           | 256 |
| 7.2.5 Intense emotion and felt meaning                                   | 257 |
| 7.2.5.1 Pupils' experience of felt meaning                               | 258 |
| 7.2.5.2 Differences between felt and perceived meaning                   | 259 |
| 7.2.6 Relationship between cognitive and affective thinking and response | 260 |
| 7.2.7 Artist's role in affective response                                | 261 |
| 7.2.8 Supporting pupils' affective response                              | 262 |
| 7.2.9 Conclusion   | 264 |
| <b>7.3 THEME THREE: ROLE OF IMAGINATION IN INTERPRETATION</b>            | 264 |
| 7.3.0 Introduction   | 264 |
| 7.3.1 Defining imagination   | 266 |
| 7.3.2 Sidestepping creativity discourse                                  | 266 |
| 7.3.3 Imagination in young children                                      | 267 |
| 7.3.4 Using imagination in art interpretation                            | 268 |
| 7.3.5 Three ways of using imagination                                    | 269 |
| 7.3.5.1 Reality versus fantasy   | 270 |
| 7.3.5.2 Fantasy, make believe and silliness                              | 272 |
| 7.3.5.3 Imagination as play  | 273 |
| 7.3.5.4 Supposing, speculating and thinking about possibilities          | 273 |
| 7.3.6 Conclusion   | 275 |
| <b>CHAPTER EIGHT: SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</b>                | 277 |
| 8.0 Introduction   | 277 |
| <b>8.1 FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</b>                                      | 277 |
| 8.1.1 Strengths and weaknesses of the ISEE                               | 277 |
| 8.1.2 Significance of the teacher variable                               | 279 |
| 8.1.3 How pupils engage with paintings using the ISEE                    | 281 |
| 8.1.4 The role of art interpretation in teaching and learning            | 284 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>8.2 REFLECTIONS ON METHODOLOGY</b>  | 287 |
| 8.2.1 Action research as a methodology for effecting change in practice                  | 287 |
| 8.2.2 Role of researcher   | 290 |
| 8.2.3 Limitations of methodology   | 291 |
| <b>8.3 IMPLICATIONS OF TEACHING ABOUT ART ARTISTS FOR THE<br/>PRIMARY ART CURRICULUM</b> | 293 |
| 8.3.1 Implications for classroom teachers  | 295 |
| 8.3.2 Selected paintings   | 296 |
| 8.3.3 Resources  | 297 |
| <b>8.4 CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE</b>   | 298 |
| <b>8.5 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH</b>   | 300 |
| <b>8.6 POSTSCRIPT: Implications for my own practice as an art history<br/>educator</b>   | 302 |
| <b>9.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>  | 305 |
| <b>10.0 LIST OF APPENDICES</b>   |     |
| 1. Observer record form  | 337 |
| 2. Approved ethics proposal for Roehampton University Ethics Committee                   | 338 |
| 3. Participant informed consent form   | 346 |
| 4. Glossary of coded names and terminology   | 347 |
| 5. Amendments from piloted pupil interviews  | 348 |
| 6. Staff questionnaire   | 349 |
| 7. Profiles of staff and pupils  | 350 |
| 8. Piloted staff questionnaire   | 351 |
| 9. Amendments to staff questionnaire   | 352 |
| 10. Comparison of paintings for Staff Questionnaire (Task Two)                           | 353 |
| 11. Pupil interview schedule   | 354 |
| 12. Request for pupil's permission to participate in interview                           | 356 |
| 13. Pre-selected group of twelve paintings for Task One                                  | 357 |
| 14. Selected painting for pupil interview schedule, <i>Allegro Strepitoso</i>            | 358 |
| 15. Teacher record form  | 359 |
| 16. Governor monitoring form   | 360 |
| 17. Research lesson worksheets   | 361 |
| 18. Coded patterns and categories sheet  | 364 |
| 19. Colour and number coded lessons example  | 367 |
| 20. Predetermined questions for Lesson Five  | 368 |
| 21. Photograph of jigsaw puzzle pieces from <i>The Fall of Icarus</i>                    | 369 |
| 22. Cut out details from 26 selected artworks for Lesson Eight                           | 370 |
| 23. Selected paintings for InSET training and practice sessions                          | 372 |
| 24. Selected paintings for Research lesson   | 373 |
| 25. InSET morning agenda   | 374 |
| 26. InSET morning PowerPoint slides  | 375 |
| 27. InSET morning demonstration lesson plan and training resources                       | 376 |
| 28. Evaluation criteria for research   | 377 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 29. School Improvement Plan (Key Action Priority)                       | 379 |
| 30. Example of transcript from research lesson                          | 381 |
| 31. Summative evaluation question sheet and teachers' notes evaluation  | 383 |
| 32. Inuit art material  | 387 |
| 33. Legend of Sedna the Sea Goddess                                     | 388 |
| 34. Story picture planner worksheet example                             | 389 |
| 35. Summary of findings from the research                               | 390 |
| 36. Transcription of audio taped team reflection and evaluation meeting | 393 |
| 37. Example of completed teacher record form                            | 394 |
| 38. Example of research lesson with art information                     | 395 |

|  |             |
|--|-------------|
| <b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>   | <b>Page</b> |
| 1.1 Ashoona Pitseolak, <i>Facing the Wind</i>                                    | 18          |
| 1.2 Registered trademark of authenticity, Government of Canada, 1958             | 19          |
| 2.1 Elliott's model (1991) of action research                                    | 40          |
| 2.2 The action research model  | 44          |
| 3.1 Conceptual framework for informed interpretation                             | 75          |
| 3.2 The ISEE Steps   | 87          |
| 3.3 Marc Chagall, <i>The Birthday</i>  | 90          |
| 3.4 Henri Rousseau, <i>Tropical Storm, Surprised!</i>                            | 104         |
| 3.5 Pieter de Hooch, <i>Courtyard of a House in Delft</i>                        | 105         |
| 3.6 René Magritte, <i>Le Domaine d'Arnheim</i>                                   | 106         |
| 3.7 William Hogarth, <i>The Graham Children</i>                                  | 106         |
| 3.8 Pieter Brueghel, <i>The Fall of Icarus</i>                                   | 107         |
| 3.9 Thomas Gainsborough, <i>Portrait of Mr and Mrs Andrews</i>                   | 108         |
| 3.10 Fiona Rae, <i>Untitled, Grey and Brown</i>                                  | 108         |
| 4.1 Cycle One: Two strands of action research                                    | 111         |
| 4.2 Carel Weight, <i>Allegro Strepitoso</i>                                      | 116         |
| 4.3 J E Millais, <i>The Carpenter's Shop. Christ in the House of His Parents</i> | 123         |
| 4.4 G F Watts, <i>The Minotaur</i>   | 124         |
| 4.5 Unknown Mughal artist, <i>Elephant Fed by his Keeper</i>                     | 124         |
| 4.6 John Constable, <i>The Cornfield</i>   | 126         |
| 4.7 Chris Ofili, <i>No Woman, No Cry</i>   | 126         |
| 5.1 Cycle Two: Two strands of action research                                    | 143         |
| 5.2 Henri Rousseau, <i>Tropical Storm, Surprised!</i>                            | 144         |
| 5.3 Pieter de Hooch, <i>Courtyard of a House in Delft</i>                        | 148         |
| 5.4 Pieter de Hooch, <i>Courtyard of a House in Delft</i>                        | 152         |
| 5.5 Pieter de Hooch, <i>Courtyard of a House in Delft</i>                        | 156         |
| 5.6 René Magritte, <i>Le Domaine, d'Arnheim</i>                                  | 159         |
| 5.7 Year Two voting game results   | 160         |
| 5.8 William Hogarth, <i>The Graham Children</i>                                  | 163         |
| 5.9 Pieter Brueghel, <i>The Fall of Icarus</i>                                   | 167         |
| 5.10 Cut out jigsaw pieces for activity  | 167         |
| 5.11 Thomas Gainsborough, <i>Portrait of Mr and Mrs Andrews</i>                  | 170         |
| 5.12 Assortment of 26 cut out details from artwork in public collections         | 171         |
| 5.13 Fiona Rae, <i>Untitled, Grey and Brown</i>                                  | 174         |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 6.1  | Cycle Three: Two strands of action research                     | 194 |
| 6.2  | Ningeokuluk Teevee, <i>Silarjuaq (The Whole World)</i>          | 195 |
| 6.3  | Reception pupils' artwork illustrating their 'world'            | 197 |
| 6.4  | Year One pupils planning artwork                                | 199 |
| 6.5  | Year Two pupil's completed story picture planner                | 203 |
| 6.6  | Year Two pupils making clay models of Sedna                     | 204 |
| 6.7  | Year Two pupils' clay models                                    | 204 |
| 6.8  | Eugene-Louis Boudin, <i>The Approaching Storm</i>               | 207 |
| 6.9  | Photographs of Reception pupils at seaside                      | 209 |
| 6.10 | André Derain, <i>Boats in Collioure</i>                         | 210 |
| 6.11 | Year One pupils discussing <i>Boats in Collioure</i>            | 211 |
| 6.12 | Year One pupils making pictures after <i>Boats in Collioure</i> | 212 |
| 6.13 | Pieter Brueghel the Elder, <i>Children's Games</i>              | 212 |
| 6.14 | Detail of pupils cut out photographs                            | 215 |
| 6.15 | Detail of pupils' sketches of playground activities             | 215 |
| 6.16 | Pupils' newspaper copy  | 216 |
| 6.17 | Changing roles and responsibilities by cycle                    | 224 |
| 8.1  | Final revised conceptual framework model                        | 284 |

|   |             |
|---|-------------|
| <b>LIST OF TABLES</b>   | <b>Page</b> |
| 1. Panofsky's stages of interpreting meaning                                    | 17          |
| 2. Data Collection Instruments  | 55          |
| 3. Additional instruments   | 61          |
| 4. Cycle actions and data gathering   | 65          |
| 5. Process of data analysis   | 71          |
| 6. Research questions and mode of analysis                                      | 73          |
| 7. The ISEE strategy  | 84          |
| 8. Categories for art information   | 91          |
| 9. Nine research lessons  | 93          |
| 10. Inclusion and exclusion criteria  | 100         |
| 11. Selection of paintings for data collection instruments and research lessons | 102         |
| 12. Preselected group of 12 artworks for Task One (Q & interview sheet)         | 103         |
| 13. Timetable for Cycle One actions   | 112         |
| 14. Pupils' selection of artwork from Task One in interviews                    | 118         |
| 15. Timetable for Cycle Two actions   | 140         |
| 16. Lesson One: How do pupils make meaning?                                     | 144         |
| 17. Lesson Two: Learning the ISEE (Step One)                                    | 148         |
| 18. Lesson Three: Learning the ISEE (Step Two)                                  | 152         |
| 19. Lesson Four: Learning the ISEE (Step Three)                                 | 156         |
| 20. Lesson Five: Multiple Interpretations                                       | 159         |
| 21. Lesson Six: Learning about the past from a painting                         | 163         |
| 22. Lesson Seven: The sum of the parts helps you understand the whole           | 167         |
| 23. Lesson Eight: Which animal suits the context?                               | 170         |
| 24. Lesson Nine: Interpreting a non figurative painting                         | 174         |
| 25. Summary of TAs' observational comments                                      | 178         |
| 26. Timetable for Cycle Three actions   | 191         |
| 27. Lesson plan written by Reception teachers (A and B)                         | 196         |
| 28. Lesson plan written by Year Two teacher (D)                                 | 200         |
| 29. Timetable for Year Two lesson (2)   | 213         |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 30. Group interview schedule (pupils)  | 219 |
| 31. Agenda for final summative meeting | 222 |
| 32. Sorting data for analysis          | 227 |